

Available online at www.sciencedirect.com

Food **Chemistry**

Food Chemistry 104 (2007) 842–851

www.elsevier.com/locate/foodchem

Analytical, Nutritional and Clinical Methods

Static headspace analysis-olfactometry (SHA-O) of odor impact components in salted-dried white herring (Ilisha elongata)

Hau Yin Chung^{a,b,c,*}, Chi Wang Yeung^a, Joo-Shin Kim^d, Feng Chen^e

a Department of Biology, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, New Territories, Hong Kong SAR, China

^b Food and Nutritional Sciences Programme, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, New Territories, Hong Kong SAR, China

^c Food Science Laboratory, The Chinese University of Hong Kong, Shatin, New Territories, Hong Kong SAR, China

 d Pulmuone Co. Ltd., Pulmuone, R.D. Center, Seoul, Republic of Korea

^e Department of Food Science and Human Nutrition, Clemson University, 224 Poole Agriculture Center, Clemson, SC 29634, United States

Received 20 June 2005; received in revised form 17 August 2006; accepted 17 August 2006

Abstract

The odorous components of salted-dried white herrings from different treatment conditions were determined by static headspace analysis-olfactometry (SHA-O). Fish samples were purchased from two locations, manufactured by two methods, purchased for two consecutive years, and investigated at two conditions (raw and steamed). Twenty-seven odorous compounds were found among the fish products including alcohols (3), aldehydes (7), miscellaneous compounds (2), ketones (3), other N-containing compounds (4), other O-containing compounds (1), and S-containing compounds (7). Seven potent components including 3-methylbutanal (almond-like), methanethiol (decay vegetable-like), dimethyl trisulfide (fried garlic, onion-like), hydrogen sulfide (rotten egg-like), trimethylamine (fishy, fish oil-like) bis(methylthio)methane (fried garlic/onion-like), and (Z)-4-heptenal (fatty, grease-like) were identified. The majority of them did not have significant difference among the different treatments ($p > 0.05$). Other less potent components may contribute to the odor of a fish due to their differences in distribution and potency. Statistically, only location and method \times period interaction have major impacts on the magnitude of the odorants found in salted-dried white herrings ($p < 0.05$). $© 2006 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.$

Keywords: Herrings; Odor; Preservation

1. Introduction

Fish preservation is common in a number of developed and developing countries ([Infofish, 1983](#page-9-0)). Among various preservation methods, the combination of salting and drying of fish has a long history. Salted-dried fishes have a "salty, characteristic flavor and odor" [\(Subba Rao, 1967\)](#page-9-0). Numerous articles have reviewed the odorous components found in seafood as well as their mechanisms of formation [\(Baek & Cadwallader, 1997; Boyle, Lindsay, & Stuiber,](#page-8-0) [1993; Durnford & Shahidi, 1998; Lindsay, 1990; Shahidi](#page-8-0) [& Cadwallader, 1997; Spurvey, Pan, & Shahidi, 1998\)](#page-8-0).

[Josephson \(1991\)](#page-9-0) categorized the mechanisms of odor formation in seafood into four groups including: (1) enzyme-mediated conversion of lipids and carotenoids, (2) autoxidative degradation of free fatty acids, (3) enzymatic conversion of sulfur-nitrogen-containing precursors, and (4) thermal decomposition of species-specific precursors.

White herring *(Ilisha elongata)* is an important commercial marine fish dwelling in the Indo-Pacific region which includes the East China Sea, Korea, and southern Japan [\(AFCD, 2004\)](#page-8-0). It is considered as a pelagic fish, abundant from February to May, and has a maximum length of 40.5 cm with a compressed and elongated body covered with large scales. It has large eyes and an upward pointing mouth. The colors of its dorsal and ventral bodies are silvery white and pale yellowish green, respectively, with pale yellowish white fins.

Corresponding author. Tel.: +852 2609 6149; fax: +852 2603 5745. E-mail address: anthonychung@cuhk.edu.hk (H.Y. Chung).

^{0308-8146/\$ -} see front matter © 2006 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. doi:10.1016/j.foodchem.2006.08.036

Salted-dried white herring is a traditional dried seafood product produced in Hong Kong, particularly in the old fishing site known as Tai O in the Lautau Island. This is where some fishermen still produce salted-dried fishes and other dried seafood products for sale to customers. Whole-sale dried seafood shops are also located in another area known as Sai Wan in the Hong Kong Island where shoppers often sell imported salted-dried fishes produced from other countries using the same traditional production steps from Hong Kong. Similar to the kench curing of fish used in the western culture where fish flesh is rubbed and solid salt is made to penetrate the meat, the fish is stacked and the extracted moisture is drained away ([Poulter, 1988\)](#page-9-0); after removal of the internal organs and the gills in the preparation of salted-dried fish, both the fish body and gill cavities are filled with dry salt and are layered alternatively with fish and salt ([Horner, 1997](#page-9-0)). Depending on the season, the amount of salt used and the number of fermentation days are adjusted accordingly. Solar drying is commonly practiced after the salting step. In the past when cooling facilities were not readily available to refrigerate fishes caught from the ocean, the rate of autolysis was high before landing. The texture of these salted-dried fish products were often softer than those that were refrigerated before being prepared as salted-dried fishes ([Hsu, 1994\)](#page-9-0). For food preparation, a small chuck of salted-dried fish is baked and/or steamed before serving ([Herklots & Lin,](#page-9-0) [1960](#page-9-0)). Although the salted-dried fish is a traditional food and is enjoyed by consumers, not much information has been reported on the odorants that are responsible for these fish products.

Therefore, by using the mild static-headspace analysisolfactometry (SHA-O) technique, this investigation focused on the headspace volatile components that were responsible for the characteristic odorants of the salteddried white herring. In addition, the effects of the fish product in raw and steamed (s) conditions, the processing methods – delayed (D) and refrigerated (R) , the purchase locations – Sai Wan (S) and Tai O (T) , as well as the purchase periods – year 2001 (a) and year 2002 (b) on the overall odor strength of the headspace components were also evaluated.

2. Material and methods

2.1. Sample preparation

Salted-dried Chinese herrings (*I. elongata*) prepared by both delayed salting (D) and refrigerated salting (R) methods were bought from two famous dried-seafood locations, namely, Tai O (T) on Lantau Island and Sai Wan (S) in Hong Kong Island, during the years 2001–2002. Both places are located in Hong Kong.

The samples were transported back to the Biology Department at the Chinese University of Hong Kong in their original package and were stored temporarily in a cool and dry location. Within two days of purchase, the fishes were grouped and beheaded. They were then kept in an air-tight glass container stored in a freezer $(-20 \degree C)$ before further treatment and analysis were carried out.

2.2. Gas chromatography static headspace analysis and olfactometry (GC-SHA-O)

Odor evaluations of the samples were carried out using the GC-SHA-O technique. Twenty grams of fish were obtained by cutting across the dorsal and ventral fins of each fish with a pair of stainless steel scissors. The chuck of meat was then divided vertically into two halves. One halve (10 g) was used in its raw state without steaming, while the other was steamed (s). The steamed samples were prepared by steaming raw samples above boiling water in a small stainless steel pot covered with a lid for 20 min. Three randomly picked halves from a batch of fishes of the same production conditions were combined into one sample. For both steamed and non-steamed samples (consists of three fish halves), they were each homogenized with a household blender (MX-T2GM, Matsushita Electric Co. Ltd., Taipei, Taiwan) for 10 s, followed by manually mixing with a stainless steel spatula. A 20 g homogenized sample was used for aroma analysis by transferring the fish sample to a 285 ml gas-tight glass culture vessel (Wheaton culture vessel, model no. 991760, Wheaton Scientific, NJ, USA). The vessel with the sample was left to equilibrate at 50 °C in an incubator (model 132000, Boekel Scientific, Cambridge, England) for 2 h before the headspace volume was withdrawn for evaluation. For the steamed portion, randomly picked fish samples of the same conditions were first steamed. The pooled samples were blended immediately, and a 20 g portion was transferred to a 285 ml gas tight glass jar and equilibrated at 50 °C for 2 h as done previously.

Then 25, 5, 1, or 0.2 ml of headspace was collected from the incubated culture vessel with a gas-tight syringe (SGE International Pty Ltd, Victoria, Australia) and was injected into the temperature programmable cooled injection system (CIS 4, Gerstel, Mülheim an der Ruhr, Germany) of a gas chromatography (model 6890, Hewlett–Packard Co., Palo Alto, CA, USA) coupled to a mass selective spectrometor (model 5973, Hewlett–Packard Co., Palo Alto, CA, USA), a flame ionization detector (Hewlett–Packard Co., Palo Alto, CA, USA), and an olfactometor (Gerstel, Mülheim an der Ruhr, Germany) (GC-MS-FID-O) system for analyses. The CIS was cryogenically cooled down to -150 °C with liquid nitrogen and was held at that temperature during the headspace injection to cryofocus the volatile compounds in the injector. During injection, it was heated to 230 °C at a ramp rate of 10 °C/s and held at $230 °C$ for 10 min.

A fused silica open tubular column (Supelcowax-10, 60 m length \times 0.25 mm i.d. \times 0.25 µm film thickness, nominal; Supelco, Inc., Bellefonte, PA, USA) was used as the analytical column. Helium gas (ultrahigh purity grade, 99.999%) was used as the carrier gas with a constant linear velocity of 30 cm/s. Oven temperature was programmed from 30 °C to 195 °C at a ramp rate of 6 °C/min. The initial and final hold times were 5 and 30 min, respectively. Mass selective detector (MSD) interface, ion source, and MS quadrupole temperatures were set at 250° C, 230° C, and $106 \degree C$, respectively. The ionization voltage was 70 eV, and the electron multiplier voltage was 1200 V.

The column flow was split into the three detectors (MSD, FID, and O) at a split ratio of 1:1:1 using deactivated capillary columns of different diameters and lengths. Results from FID facilitate the identification of the perceived odorants by matching their elution time between the olfactory and the FID data, as well as their eluted peak between the MS and FID data. The transfer line of the sniff port for the olfactometor was set at 200 $^{\circ}$ C. Three panelists separately evaluated the effluence of the same sample from a sniff port and then reported the sensation, time range, and intensity of each odorant perceived in a report sheet provided during a 30-min session. Until a panelist reported no perceived odor for a sample, the same procedures would be repeated at the next smaller volume (which is 1/5 of the previous volume).

2.3. Compound identification for GC-SHA-O

Tentative identifications of compounds were done by matching the mass spectra of unknowns with those suggested by the Wiley Chemical database (7Nth edition, Hewlett–Packard Co., Palo Alto, CA, USA) or their characteristic odors. The compounds were positively identified by comparing their mass spectra, retention times/indices, and odor descriptors with those of the authentic standards [\(van den Dool & Kratz, 1963](#page-9-0)) under the same experimental conditions.

2.4. Calculation of the volume ratio (VR)

The volume ratio (VR) of a compound is defined as the largest headspace volume used as a reference in the evaluation divided by the smallest effective headspace volume perceived by a panelist. The higher the calculated VR of a compound, the stronger its flavor intensity will be. The highest reference volume used was designed at 125 ml, since a panelist might miss an odorant at 25 ml (the highest injection volume), while other panelists might be able to perceive it at 25 ml. The mean VR of an odorous compound was calculated by the geometric mean of VRs from the three panelists.

2.5. Statistical analysis

One-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) was carried out to determine the differences among treatment groups at $p = 0.05$. Multiple comparisons using the Tukey test were carried out for ANOVA with significance. Multivariate analysis of variance (MANOVA) and univariate analysis of variance (ANOVA) were used to test the variances of the volume ratios (VRs) of the odorants from raw or steamed conditions, the purchase locations, the purchase periods, and the processing methods. Pillar's criterion, Hotelling's trace, and Wilks' λ were used as the statistical selection criteria for the dependant variables in the MAN-OVA. The statistical analysis was performed using a Minitab Version 14.13 software package (State College, PA, USA).

3. Results and discussion

3.1. Aroma composition of salted-dried white herring

Salted-dried white herrings belonging to different treatment conditions were analyzed using the static headspace analysis-olfactometry (SHA-O) in order to determine the odorants that were responsible for their characteristic flavor. Twenty-seven compounds were found and distributed among seven chemical classes [\(Table 1](#page-4-0)). Aldehydes had the highest count of seven compounds, whereas the lowest count of one was with the oxygen-containing compound. Other chemical classes included sulfur-containing compounds (7), nitrogen-containing compounds (4), alcohols (3), ketones (3), and miscellaneous compounds (2).

3.1.1. Aldehydes

Among the aldehdyes, both propanal and 3-methylbutanal were found in all the treatments in the raw and steamed fishes. Meanwhile, (Z) -4-heptenal was found only in the steamed samples but not in the raw ones. The rest of the aldehydes were missing among the treatment groups. Described as almond-like, 3-methylbutanal was found to be the most potent component by SHA-O within the aldehydes as well as in all other chemical classes. Moreover, 3-methylbutanal has been reported in steamed distillated extracts in salted fermented fish and shrimp pastes [\(Cha](#page-8-0) [& Cadwallader, 1995\)](#page-8-0). It could be formed by the Strecker degradation of leucine in the course of Maillard reaction when the samples were subjected to solar-drying operation [\(Collin, Osman, Delcambre, El-Zayat, & Doufour, 1993\)](#page-8-0). It might also be formed via the microbial degradation of amino acids. Propanal was described as a nutty, Maillard reaction-like odor, and was likely produced by the autoxidation of polyunsaturated fatty acids or by the retro-aldol condensation of 2,4-heptadienal which was also identified in some of the treatment groups [\(Josephson & Lindsay,](#page-9-0) [1987\)](#page-9-0). These compounds were probably formed when the fish died and during the drying step.

Carbon-6, -8, and -9 alcohols and carbonyls were reported to contribute to the fresh fish flavor ([Josephson](#page-9-0) [& Lindsay, 1986\)](#page-9-0). In the current experiment, only hexanal belongs to such classes. A green odor was described by the panelists for the component, respectively. It could be formed by the controlled oxidation of the long chain polyunsaturated fatty acids mediated by the lipoxygenase system in live fishes [\(Lindsay, 1990](#page-9-0)). On the other hand, (Z)-4-heptenal has a fatty grease odor and might be formed

by the retro-aldol condensation of (E,\mathbb{Z}) -2,6-nonadienal which was derived from lipid autoxidation after the fish died [\(Josephson & Lindsay, 1987\)](#page-9-0).

3.1.2. Nitrogen-containing compounds

One prominent member in the nitrogen-containing compound group was the trimethylamine which had a very high VR and was found in all treatment groups in both raw and steamed samples. Trimethylamine was described by the panelists as fishy, salty, and with a deterioration-like aroma. It was generally believed to be produced by microbial metabolism in the presence of the precursor trimethylamine oxide [\(Herberd, Flick, & Martin, 1985](#page-8-0)). During the salted-dried fish production, a sufficient amount of time and substrate was available for the contaminating microorganisms to break down the substrate and produce the odorous compound. It was reasonable to find trimethylamine among those potent odorants, though it did not always have the highest impact as shown from some of the treatment groups ([Tables 1a and 1b](#page-4-0)).

Two pyrazines, 2,3-dimethylpyrazine and 2-ethyl-6 methylpyrazine, were found to be randomly distributed among the treatment groups. The former has been reported in dried scallops and cooked crabmeats, whereas the latter was identified in cocoa products, potato chips, and so on ([Buttery, Seifert, Guadagni, & Ling, 1971; Chung, 1999;](#page-8-0) [Chung, Yung, & Kim, 2001; Reineccius, Keeney, & Weiss](#page-8-0)[berger, 1972](#page-8-0)). Pyrazines are products formed between sugars and amino acids under suitable conditions ([Maga &](#page-9-0) [Sizer, 1973\)](#page-9-0). High temperature generally promotes the rate of formation of the Maillard reaction products ([Lane &](#page-9-0) [Nursten, 1983](#page-9-0)). However, when the temperature is mild, as in the solar drying of salted-dried fish, the rate of Maillard product formation may be low. This could lead to the low amount and odor intensity of the pyrazines found in the samples.

3.1.3. Other oxygen-containing compounds, alcohols, and ketones

None of the compounds found among the three chemical classes including other oxygen-containing compounds, alcohols, and ketones were identified in all treatment groups. In addition, their average VR ranged from zero to six. Furfural had a potato-like aroma as described by the panelists and was the only component found in the other O-containing compound class. It is a product of Maillard reaction ([Fors, 1983\)](#page-8-0) and could be produced from melanoidins at a high temperature [\(Tehrani, Kersiene,](#page-9-0) [Adams, Venskutonis, & De Kimpe, 2002\)](#page-9-0). Meanwhile, 3-methylbutanol and (Z) -2-penten-1-ol were found in the frozen and fresh Mackerels, respectively, and were likely produced by the decomposition of the secondary hydroperoxides of fatty acids ([Alasalvar, Quantick, & Grigor, 1997\)](#page-8-0). Cyclopentanol was formed when polyasparagine was subjected to irradiation ([Ahn, 2002\)](#page-8-0), and it had bug-like and nutty aromas as described by the panelists. Furthermore, 2,3-butanedione and 2,3-pentanedione possessed a sour note and a fruity note, respectively, and were products from either the fragmentation of sugar in Maillard reaction or in lipid oxidation [\(Frankel, 1980; Yaylayan, 1997](#page-8-0)). Finally, 3-hexanone was reported to have a fruity flavor in the fish samples. It was also described to provide an ethereal, grape, and wine-like aroma elsewhere [\(Sigma–](#page-9-0) [Aldrich, 2004\)](#page-9-0). Crab meat, European dry-cured ham, and microwaved or boiled potatoes were reported to contain 3-hexanone ([Chung, 1999; Chung & Cadwallader, 1993;](#page-8-0) [Oruna-Concha, Bakker, & Ames, 2002a, Oruna-Concha,](#page-8-0) Bakker, & Ames, 2002b; Sabio, Vidal-Aragón, Bernalte, [& Gata, 1998\)](#page-8-0). During fish processing, lipid degradation could lead to the formation of 3-hexanone, particularly when the fish was subjected to solar drying ([Oruna-Concha](#page-9-0) [et al., 2002b](#page-9-0)).

3.1.4. Sulfur-containing compounds

Six sulfur-containing compounds were found in the fish samples, and majority of them had very high average VRs. They all had characteristic odors. Methional had a soy sauce, meaty, cooked corn-like odor ([Tables 1a and](#page-4-0) [1b](#page-4-0)). It has been found in other seafoods such as blue crab meat and ripened anchovy ([Chung & Cadwallader,](#page-8-0) [1994; Triqui & Guth, 1997](#page-8-0)). Methionine was able to undergo Strecker degradation to produce methional ([Chan & Reineccius, 1994; Morton, Akroyd, & May,](#page-8-0) [1960](#page-8-0)). With long drying time and ambient temperature during production, the Strecker degradation of the amino acid was facilitated.

The odor of dimethyltrisulfide was described as cooked onion-like in the literature. It was considered as an off-flavor at high concentration when royal red prawns were spoiled by the natural, contaminating microbe flora ([Whit](#page-9-0)[field, Freeman, & Bannister, 1981](#page-9-0)). When fish was subjected to similar conditions for contamination like those of prawns during processing, the generation of dimethyltrisulfide became highly possible. In the current investigation, the panelists described the aroma as fried garlic- and onion-like aromas, and had a relatively high odor impact on the salted-dried products. Although not found in all treatment groups, dimethyldisulfide possessed a fried garlic/town gas-like odor similar to dimethyltrisulfide. This compound was reported in the headspace of the refrigerated mackerel, but not in the fresh samples ([Alasalvar](#page-8-0) [et al., 1997](#page-8-0)). This compound could be formed by the oxidation of methanthiol or the microbial degradation of methanione ([Christensen, Kjaer, & Madsen, 1981](#page-8-0)). Hydrogen sulfide was reported to have a rotten egg odor and was generated from meat composed mainly of sulfur-containing amino acids such as cystine and/or methionine, e.g., in beef when subjected to high temperature [\(Machiels, Istasse, &](#page-9-0) [van Ruth, 2004](#page-9-0)).

Bis(methylthio)methane has a fried garlic/onion-like odor and was the second most potent component detected by the SHA-O. It was reported to be present in seafood, white truffle, and hop [\(Fiecchi, Galli-kienle, Scala, & Capella,](#page-8-0) [1967; Lermusieau, Bulens, & Collin, 2001; Whitfield, 1999;](#page-8-0)

No. ^a	$\mathsf{Compound}^\mathsf{b}$	RI ^c	Confirmation ^d	Descriptore	Mean volume ratio of salted-dried white herrings ^f Non-steamed (raw)								Mean ^g
					RSa	DSa	RTa	DTa	RSb	DSb	RTb	DTb	
	Aldehydes												
$\mathbf{1}$	Propanal	708	M.R.O	Nutty, Maillard reaction	15	9	9	125	9	25	125	25	43
$\overline{2}$	3-Methylbutanal	864	M.R.O	Almond	125	366	73	366	73	43	366	625	254
3	Hexanal	1076	M.R.O	Green	3	3	$\overline{3}$	5	$\mathbf{0}$	$\overline{0}$	25	43	10
$\overline{4}$	2-Methyl-2-butenal ^{t*}	1104	M ₀	Coffee	$0^{\rm a}$	0 ^b	$\overline{3}$	0 ^c	3	0 ^d	0 ^e	0 ^f	
5	Heptanal	1180	M, R, O	Fishy, fish oil, town gas	$\boldsymbol{0}$	5	9	43	25	9	θ	θ	11
6	(Z) -4-heptenal	1236	M, R, O	Fatty, grease	43	25	73	73	$\mathbf Q$	Ω	125	125	59
$7\overline{ }$	(E,E) -2,4-heptadienal ^{t*}	1495	M ₀	Root, ginseng	15	9	15	5	θ	5	θ	9	τ
	Miscellaneous compounds												
8	Unknown 1	1018		Fruity	$0^{\rm a}$	0 ^b	$0^{\rm c}$	0 ^d	0^e	0 ^f	\mathfrak{Z}	0 ^g	$\boldsymbol{0}$
9	Unknown 2	1467		Moldy	θ	$\overline{3}$	5	$\overline{0}$	3	θ	θ	$\overline{0}$	
	N-containing compounds												
10	Trimethylamine	610	M.R.O	Fishy, salty, deterioration	214	25	125	9	214	125	25	125	108
11	2,3-Dimethyl-pyrazine	1342	M.R.O	Pop corn, rice	$\overline{3}$	5	5	9	$\overline{0}$	$\mathbf{0}$	3	3	\mathfrak{Z}
12	2-Ethyl-4-methyl-1H-pyrrole ^{t*}	1369	M	Peanut skin, cooked rice	$5^{\rm a}$	366^{a-o}	0 ^b	0 ^c	0 ^d	$0^{\rm e}$	0 ^f	0 ^g	46
13	2-Ethyl-6-methylpyrazine ^{t*}	1390	M	Metallic, rusty	9	9	θ	θ	5	25	3	9	τ
	Other O-containing compounds												
14	Furfural	1482	M.R.O	Potato	$\mathbf{0}$	5	5	$\overline{0}$	$\overline{0}$	15	9	$\mathbf{0}$	$\overline{4}$
	Alcohols												
15	3-Methyl-1-butanol*	1187	M, R, O	Metallic, sharp	$0^{\rm a}$	9^{a-o}	0 ^b	$0^{\rm c}$	3 ^d	$5^{\rm e}$	0^f	0^{g}	2
16	Cyclopentanol	1284	M, R, O	Bug, nutty	$\mathbf{0}$	\mathfrak{Z}	$\boldsymbol{0}$	$\overline{0}$	9	\mathfrak{Z}	5	$\overline{\mathbf{3}}$	3
17	(Z) -2-penten-1-ol	1297	M, R, O	Mushroom, woody	0^a	0 ^b	$5^{\rm c}$	3 ^d	0 ^e	0 ^f	0 ^g	25^{a-o}	$\overline{\mathbf{A}}$
	Ketones												
18	2,3-Butanedione	969	M.R.O	Sour	9	$\mathbf{3}$	5	$\overline{0}$	9	9	9	5	6
19	2,3-Pentanedione [®]	1053	M, R, O	Fruity	0 ^{a,h}	0 ^{b,c}	$5^{\circ,z}$	$15^{b,e-m,o,s,y}$	$0^{j,n}$	$3^{\mathrm{o},\mathrm{p}}$	$0^{1,u}$	0 ^{f,q}	$\overline{3}$
20	3-Hexanone	1057	M, R, O	Fruity	θ	θ	Ω	Ω	θ	5	3	3	
	S-containing compounds												
21	Hydrogen sulfide ^{t*}	614	\mathcal{O}	Rotten egg	$Q^{a,h,s}$	366^{b-n}	$125^{1, o, w}$	$366^{p-w,y,cc,ii}$	$0^{j,u,x}$	$0^{c,y,z}$	$15^{\rm m,ee}$	5 f,q,aa	111
22	Methanethiol ^{t*}	672	M, O	Decay vegetable	214	366	73	366	125	125	25	25	165
23	Dimethyl disulfide	1075	M, R, O	Fried garlic, towngas	$\overline{0}$	$\overline{0}$	$\overline{0}$	$\overline{3}$	15	$\overline{3}$	5	$\overline{0}$	$\overline{3}$
24	Bis(methylthio) methane [*]	1288	M, R, O	Fried garlic/onion	125^{a}	$73^{\rm b}$	5°	9 ^d	366	125°	1 ^f	25 ^g	93
25	Dimethyl trisulfide [®]	1386	M, R, O	Fried garlic/onion	366	5	25	43	366	125	43	214	148
26	Methional	1456	M, R, O	Soy sauce	25	Ω	9	9	9	5	3	43	13
27	3-Thiophene-carboxaldehyde ^t	1685	M.O	Meaty, cooked corn, mint	25	θ	15	15	25	15	Ω	Ω	12

Table 1aOdorous compounds found in the headspace of the raw salted-dried white herring

^a Compound number.

^b Identified compound. t: tentatively identified compound. *: statistical significance, $p < 0.05$, One-way ANOVA.
^c Linear retention index (van den Dool & [Kratz,](#page-9-0) 1963).

^d Method of confirmation. M: mass spectrum; R: retention index; O: odor.

e Descriptor(s) used by panelists.

Volume ratio (VR) of salted-dried herring under various conditions. D: delay treatment; R: refrigerated treatment; T: purchase location at Tai O; S: purchase location at Sai Wan; a: purchase period in year 2001; b: purcha period in 2002; s: steamed sample if specified, otherwise, it is not steamed or raw. Same letter across treatments of a compound indicates significantly different $(p < 0.05)$. $n = 3$ for each condition.

^g Overall mean VR of a compound from the raw treatment groups.

^a Compound number.

^b Identified compound. t: tentatively identified compound. *: statistical significance, $p \le 0.05$, One-way ANOVA.

 c Linear retention index (van den Dool & [Kratz,](#page-9-0) 1963).

^d Method of confirmation. M: mass spectrum; R: retention index; O: odor.

e Descriptor(s) used by panelists.

Volume ratio (VR) of salted-dried herring under various conditions. D: delay treatment; R: refrigerated treatment; T: purchase location at Tai O; S: purchase location at Sai Wan; a: purchase period in year 2001; b: purcha period in 2002; s: steamed sample if specified, otherwise, it is not steamed or raw. Same letter across treatments of a compound indicates significantly different ($p < 0.05$). $n = 3$ for each condition.

^g Overall mean VR of a compound from the steamed treatment groups.

[Whitfield, Freeman, Last, & Bannister, 1981](#page-8-0)). [Whitfield](#page-9-0) [\(1999\)](#page-9-0) suggested that the compound could originate from the diet of marine animals. Alternatively, in the presence of suitable microorganisms such as Pseudomonas or Achromobacter sp. and trimethylamino oxide (TMAO) demethylase in the animial's digestion system, substrates including cysteine and trimethyloxide could eventually transform to form the potent component ([Whitfield & Tindale, 1984\)](#page-9-0). Similarly, bis(methylthio)methane found in salted dried fish could be accumulated from the fish diet in live fish or could be generated from the microbial mediated enzymatic reaction in both alive and dead fish.

Meanwhile, 3-thiophenecarboxaldehyde was reported among the products when lipid interacted with products from the Maillard reaction [\(Elmore, Campo, Enser, &](#page-8-0) [Mottram, 2002](#page-8-0)). In the current evaluation, it was described as having a meaty, cooked corn, mint-like odor.

Overall, 27 odor compounds were found, and the mechanisms by which the odorants were formed in the salted dried fishes included, when the fish was alive, the natural lipoxygenase-mediated lipid oxidation, and when the fish died and during salting and drying, microbial contamination and degradation, lipid autoxidation, Strecker degradation, Maillard reaction, and interaction between different substrates. In addition, some compounds might originate from the diet of the animal. Based on the observed results, many odorants were formed when the fish died, and their amounts depended on their formation mechanisms which were influenced by temperature, concentration of substrates, microbial load, and so on. Adequate control of these parameters during production may produce products with optimal flavor quality.

3.2. Contribution of the odorants to the salted-dried fish products

When the compounds in [Table 1](#page-4-0) were arranged according to the order of their retention times, the majority of the components with high VR were clustered at the early retention index followed by compounds that were low in VR. Then another two clusters were observed. The initial first cluster mainly contains trimethylamine, hydrogen sulfide, methanethiol, propanal, and 3-methylbutanal. Majority of these compounds were very potent in odor in both raw and steamed samples with average VRs of 108, 123; 111, 94; 165, 177; 43, 34; and 254, 310, respectively. Interestingly, both bis(methylthio)methane and dimethyl trisulfide had similar odor sensations and were described as fried garlic- and fried onion-like odors by the panelists. Moreover, if their VRs are summed up in each treatment group, their total values generally come close to the highest value in each of their respective treatments. This may suggest that the fried onion-like odor is generally an important odor in salted-dried white herring based on the observed results.

A careful inspection of the magnitude of the odorants in each treatment group in [Table 1](#page-4-0) shows that each group has

Table 2

^a Degree of freedom.

b Statistical selection criteria based on Pillai's criterion, Hotelling's trace and Wilks' λ .

^c Statistically insignificance.

Significant difference at $p < 0.05$.

its own compound profiles with different average VRs, though the three clusters of potent components are often present. In the raw, salted-dried white herrings, based on the mean VR of each component ([Table 1\)](#page-4-0), the decreasing odor strength (with mean $VR > 40$) of the components is shown: 3-methylbutanal, methanethiol, dimethyltrisulfide, hydrogen sulfide, trimethylamine, bis(methylthio)methane, (Z) -4-heptenal, 2-ethyl-4-methyl-1H-pyrrole, and propanal. Similarly, for the steamed samples ([Table 1](#page-4-0)), the ranking (with average $VR > 40$) is as follows: 3-methylbutanal, methanethiol, dimethyltrisulfide, bis(methylthio)methane, trimethylamine, hydrogen sulfide, and (Z)-4-heptanal. Apparently, due to the relatively high VR of the first seven compounds, they were generally more important in contributing to the aroma of the salted-dried white herring of different treatments. Slight variations in the odor strength of any components in each treatment group would probably only be perceived by very sensitive consumers. [Table 1](#page-4-0) also shows that potent components are not consistently maintained at similar magnitudes. In fact, statistical analyses using one-way ANOVA and Tukey test at $p = 0.05$ level showed that most variations were due to random error. This suggested that their VR were similar among different treatment groups. For components with low VR, the majority of them did not differ significantly. Often, significance was found only in one treatment group but was not found in the rest of the treatments. In short, most treatment groups of both potent and less potent components were statistically similar, suggesting that the odorants contributed similarly to different treatments. Moreover, differences in odor perception were mostly contributed by a small number of odorants and their distributions in different treatments.

3.3. Influence of treatments (raw/steamed, periods, locations, methods) on the overall odor intensity perceived

MANOVA was used to evaluate if differences existed among the treatment groups. [Table 2](#page-6-0) shows that only the location effect and the method \times period interaction were significantly different ($p \le 0.05$). This suggested that the mean vectors of the different treatment groups involved in the locations or the method \times period interactions were not equal, and that their dependent variables, i.e. the VR of odorants, varied across the locations as well as the method \times period interactions.

In order to further understand the influence of different purchase locations on the strength of the odorants, additional univariate ANOVA on each compound was carried out, and the results related to the factor – locations are shown in Table 3. No significant difference was found for more than half of the compounds in the table, suggesting that the odorous compounds have similar odor contribution from the two locations ($p > 0.05$). This observation has an important implication to the potent components, particularly trimethylamine and methanethiol which were very high in their mean VRs, but were not statistically significant ($p > 0.05$). These compounds maintained similar and strong odor strengths in the two locations. For the remaining 11 compounds having significance ($p < 0.05$) in Table 3, highly potent compounds including hydrogen sulfide, 3-methylbutanal, bis(methylthio)methane, and trimethyl trisulfide were found and were expected to have a major influence on the odor perception of the fish product.

Collectively, location S has a slightly higher overall mean VR than that of location T which is indicative of the higher influence of location S on the odorant strength. However, a careful inspection of these significant odorants showed that a majority of them (seven compounds) had higher mean VRs in location T than those in location S. Furthermore, potent odorants including hydrogen sulfide, 3-methylbutanal, and (Z) -4-heptanal were found with a higher VR in location T. Conversely, two potent odorants including bis(methylthio)methane and dimethyl trisulfide were found to have a significantly higher odor impact in location S than that in location T (Table 3). Both locations did not have much influence in the odor strength in both trimethylamine and methanethiol. Based on both magnitude and distribution of the potent odorants, salted-dried white herrings from location S had a much stronger odorant described as a fried garlic- and onion-like aroma contributed by the two Scontaining compounds, whereas those from location T were

Table 3

Summary of the univariate ANOVA results for location effect and method \times period interaction on the odorants in salted-dried white herrings

No. ^a	Compound	Location				Mean ^d VR of location	Method \times period			
		F -Value $^{\rm b}$	p -Value	Significance ^c	S	T	F -Value $^{\rm b}$	p -Value	Significance ^c	
10	Trimethylamine	0.40	0.530		132	99	2.33	0.137		
21	Hydrogen sulfide	9.38	0.004	$* *$	57	148	1.41	0.244		
22	Methanethiol	0.36	0.551		190	152	0.69	0.411		
1	Propanal	6.46	0.016	\ast	22	55	0.07	0.797		
2	3-Methylbutanal	8.00	0.008	$\ast\ast$	203	361	0.13	0.716		
18	2,3-Butanedione	0.61	0.440		5	4	0.73	0.398		
8	Unknown 1	3.45	0.073		θ	1	0.78	0.383		
19	2,3-Pentanedione	24.67	0.000	***	Ω	6	4.21	0.048	\ast	
20	3-Hexanone	3.23	0.082			\overline{c}	0.24	0.630		
23	Dimethyl disulfide	0.42	0.523		5	$\mathbf{1}$	1.64	0.210		
3	Hexanal	9.79	0.004	$\ast\ast$	$\overline{2}$	16	1.98	0.169		
4	2-Methyl-2-butenal	1.29	0.265			$\overline{2}$	1.29	0.265		
5	Heptanal	0.01	0.908		9	9	3.75	0.062		
15	3-Methylbutanol	12.74	0.001	$* *$	$\overline{2}$	$\overline{0}$	5.53	0.025	\ast	
6	(Z) -4-heptenal	14.17	0.001	$**$	24	99	0.01	0.934		
16	Cyclopentanol	0.75	0.394		$\overline{3}$	\overline{c}	1.81	0.188		
24	Bis(methylthio)methane	7.71	0.009	$\ast\ast$	201	26	1.52	0.227		
17	(Z) -2-penten-1-ol	25.33	0.000	***	$\mathbf{0}$	5	18.53	0.000	***	
11	2,3-Dimethylpyrazine	0.36	0.555		5		2.48	0.125		
12	2-Ethyl-4-methyl-1H-pyrrole	7.55	0.010	\ast	47	\overline{c}	8.09	0.008	$**$	
25	Dimethyl trisulfide	4.97	0.033	$*$	210	106	2.53	0.121		
13	2-Ethyl-6-methylpyrazine	2.43	0.129		7	4	0.63	0.432		
26	Methional	2.94	0.096		12	19	5.85	0.021	\ast	
9	Unknown 2	1.96	0.172		2	$\mathbf{1}$	θ	0.949		
14	Furfural	1.00	0.326		4	6	2.7	0.110		
7	(E,E) -2,4-heptadienal	1.08	0.307		6	5	3.69	0.064		
27	3-Thiophenecarboxaldehyde	3.00	0.093		13	7	θ	0.968		

^a Compound number arranged in ascending order of retention index of each compound. ^b Degree of freedom.

^c Significant difference at *: $p < 0.05$, **: $p < 0.01$, ***: $p < 0.001$, -: not significant at $p = 0.05$.

^d VR: volume ratio.

dominated by the rotten egg, almond-like odor. Herrings from both locations processed similar decaying vegetablelike, fishy, salty, and deterioration-like odors [\(Table 1](#page-4-0)).

There were significant interactions for method \times period in some components ($p \le 0.05$). The results of univariate ANOVA show that five compounds were significantly different including 2,3-pentanedione, 3-methylbutanol, (Z)-2 penten-1-ol, 2-ethyl-4-methyl-1H-pyrrole, and methional [\(Table 3\)](#page-7-0), but none of them belonged to the potent components discussed earlier. Among them, the first four compounds were affected by location. The magnitudes of these five compounds were also influenced by both the processing methods and the year in which the white herrings were purchased. However, the rest of the compounds were not affected by the interaction [\(Table 3\)](#page-7-0). Due to the significant interaction, the main effects of both method and period on the strength of the odorants could not be interpreted directly. Moreover, MANOVA shows collectively that there were no differences among the odor strengths of the components when the salted-dried fish was in either raw or steamed condition ([Table 2](#page-6-0)).

4. Conclusion

In conclusion, a combined total of 27 compounds were found in the salted-dried white herrings of different treatment groups. Among them, seven compounds were very prominent and were found in most fishes. These included 3-methylbutanal (almond-like), methanethiol (decay vegetable-like), dimethyl trisulfide (fried garlic, onion-like), hydrogen sulfide (rotten egg-like), trimethylamine (fishy, fish oil-like), bis(methylthio)methane (fried garlic/onionlike), and (Z) -4-heptenal (fatty and greasy). The majority of them and many less potent components showed no significance (one-way ANOVA and Tukey test, $p > 0.05$). Statistical analyses using MANOVA showed that among the four treatment factors (purchase locations, purchase periods, processing methods, and raw-steamed conditions), only purchase location was found to be significant ($p < 0.05$) and was due mainly to the treatment groups which involve 11 odorants including four of the seven potent ones (hydrogen sulfide, 3-methylbutanal, bis(methylthio)methane and dimethyl trisulfide). The three remaining factors (method, period, and raw-steamed condition) did not have an impact on the overall odor strength. Similarly, all interactions except method \times period did not show any impact on the strength of the odorants. It is hoped that the current findings would provide specific markers and general conditions to researchers and manufacturers for the further improvement of the product so that salted-dried white herrings will have better quality and nutritional value.

Acknowledgment

This work was supported by a grant from the Research Grants Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (Project No. CUHK4164/99M).

References

- AFCD. (2004). Hong Kong Marine Fish Database. Agriculture, Food and Conservation Department, Hong Kong SAR Government, China. [<http://www.hk-fish.net>](http://www.hk-fish.net). Accessed 27 October 2004.
- Alasalvar, C., Quantick, P. C., & Grigor, J. M. (1997). Aroma compounds of fresh and stored Mackerel (Scomber scombrus). In F. Shahidi & K. R. Cadwallader (Eds.), Flavor and lipid chemistry of seafoods (pp. 39–54). Washington, DC: American Chemical Society.
- Ahn, D. U. (2002). Production of volatiles from amino acid homopolymers by irradiation. Journal of Food Science, 67, 2565–2570.
- Baek, H. H., & Cadwallader, K. R. (1997). Character-impact aroma compounds of crustaceans. In F. Shahidi & K. R. Cadwallader (Eds.), Flavor and lipid chemistry of seafoods (pp. 85–94). Washington, DC: American Chemical Society.
- Boyle, J. L., Lindsay, R. C., & Stuiber, D. A. (1993). Occurrence and properties of flavor-related bromophenols found in the marine environment: a review. Journal of Aquatic Food Product Technology, 2, 75–112.
- Buttery, R. G., Seifert, R. M., Guadagni, D. G., & Ling, L. C. (1971). Characterization of volatile pyrazine and pyridine components of potato chips. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 19, 967–971.
- Cha, Y. J., & Cadwallader, K. R. (1995). Volatile components in saltfermented fish and shrimp pastes. Journal of Food Science, 60, 19–24.
- Chan, F., & Reineccius, G. A. (1994). Kinetics of the formation of methional, dimethyl disulfide, and 2-acetylthiophene via the Maillard reaction. In C. J. Mussinan & M. E. Keelan (Eds.), Sulfur compounds in foods (pp. 127–137). Washington, DC: American Chemical Society.
- Christensen, B. W., Kjaer, A., & Madsen, J. O. (1981). Volatile sulfur compounds and other headspace constituents of north sea fish oils. Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society, 58, 1053–1057.
- Chung, H. Y. (1999). Volatile components in crabmeats of Charybdis feriatus. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 47, 2280–2287.
- Chung, H. Y., & Cadwallader, K. R. (1993). Volatile components in blue crab (Callinectes sapidus) meat and processing by-product. Journal of Food Science, 58, 1203–1211.
- Chung, H. Y., & Cadwallader, K. R. (1994). Aroma extract dilution analysis of blue crab claw meat volatiles. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 42, 2867–2870.
- Chung, H. Y., Yung, I. K. S., & Kim, J.-S. (2001). Comparison of volatile components in dried scallops (Chlamys farreri and Patinopecten yessoensis) prepared by boiling and streaming methods. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 49, 192–202.
- Collin, S., Osman, K., Delcambre, S., El-Zayat, A. I., & Doufour, J. P. (1993). Investigation of volatile flavor compounds in fresh and ripened domiati cheeses. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 41, 1659–1663.
- Durnford, E., & Shahidi, F. (1998). Flavour of fish meat. In F. Shahidi (Ed.), Flavor of meat, meat products and seafoods (pp. 131–158). London: Blackie Academic Professional.
- Elmore, J. S., Campo, M. M., Enser, M., & Mottram, D. S. (2002). Effect of lipid composition on meat-like model systems containing cysteine, ribose, and polyunsaturated fatty acids. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 50, 1126–1132.
- Fiecchi, A., Galli-kienle, M., Scala, A., & Capella, P. (1967). Bis(methylthio)methane, and odorous substance from white truffle, Tuber magnatum. Tetrahedron Letters, 18, 1681–1682.
- Fors, S. (1983). Sensory properties of volatile Maillard reaction products and related compounds: a literature review. In G. R. Waller & M. S. Feather (Eds.), The Maillard reaction in foods and nutrition (pp. 185–285). Washington, DC: American Chemical Society.
- Frankel, E. N. (1980). Lipid oxidation. Progress in Lipid Research, 19, 1–22.
- Herberd, C. E., Flick, G. J., & Martin, R. E. (1985). Occurences and significance of trimethylamine oxide and its derivatives in fish and shellfish. In R. E. Martin, G. J. Flick, C. E. Hebard, & D. R. Ward

(Eds.), Chemistry and biochemistry of marine food products (pp. 149–305). Westport, CT: AVI Publishing Co.

- Herklots, G. A. C., & Lin, S. Y. (1960). Common marine food-fishes of Hong Kong. Hong Kong: The South China Morning Post, Ltd.
- Horner, W. F. A. (1997). Preservation of fish by curing (drying, salting and smoking). In G. M. Hall (Ed.), Fish processing technology (pp. 32–73). New York: Chapman & Hall.
- Hsu, K. C. (1994). Food industry. Taipei, Taiwan: Hsu Foundation.
- Infofish (1983). Dried fish: an Asian staple. In D. James (Ed.), The production and storage of dried fish. Proceedings of the workshop on the production and storage of dried fish. 279 Supplement (pp. 1–17). Rome: Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.
- Josephson, D. B. (1991). Seafood. In H. Maarse (Ed.), Volatile compounds in foods and beverages (pp. 179–202). New York: Marcel Dekker.
- Josephson, D. B., & Lindsay, R. C. (1986). Enzyme generation of volatile aroma compounds from fresh fish. In T. H. Parliment & R. Croteau (Eds.). Biogeneration of aromas ACS symposium series 317 (pp. 201–219). Washington, DC: American Chemical Society.
- Josephson, D. B., & Lindsay, R. C. (1987). Retro-aldol degradations of unsaturated aldehydes: role in the formation of c4-heptenal from t2, c6-nonadienal in fish, oyster and other flavors. Journal of the American Oil Chemists' Society, 64, 132–138.
- Lane, M. J., & Nursten, H. E. (1983). The variety of odors produced in Maillard model systems and how they are influenced by reaction conditions. In G. R. Waller & M. S. Feather (Eds.). The Maillard reaction in foods and nutrition, ACS symposium series 215 (pp. 141–158). Washington DC: American Chemical Society.
- Lermusieau, G., Bulens, M., & Collin, S. (2001). Use of GC-olfactometry to identify the hop aromatic compounds in beer. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 49, 3867–3874.
- Lindsay, R. C. (1990). Fish flavors. Food Reviews International, 6, 437–455.
- Machiels, D., Istasse, L., & van Ruth, S. M. (2004). Gas chromatographyolfactometry analysis of beef meat originating from differently fed Belgian Blue, Limousin and Aberdeen Angus bulls. Food Chemistry, 86, 377–383.
- Maga, J. A., & Sizer, C. E. (1973). Pyrazines in foods. A review. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 21, 22–31.
- Morton, I. D., Akroyd, P., & May, C. G. (1960). Flavoring substances. US Patent 2,934,437.
- Oruna-Concha, M. J., Bakker, J., & Ames, J. M. (2002a). Comparison of the volatile components of eight cultivars of potato after microwave baking. LWT – Food Science and Technology, 35, 80–86.
- Oruna-Concha, M. J., Bakker, J., & Ames, J. (2002b). Comparison of the volatile components of two cultivars of potato cooked by boiling, conventional baking and microwave baking. Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture, 92, 1080–1087.
- Poulter, R. G. (1988). Processing and storage of traditional dried and smoked fish products. In J. R. Burt (Ed.), Fish smoking and drying the effect of smoking and drying on the nutritional properties of fish (pp. 86). Essex: Elsevier.
- Reineccius, G. A., Keeney, P. G., & Weissberger, W. (1972). Factors affecting the concentration of pyrazines in cocoa beans. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 20, 202–206.
- Sabio, E., Vidal-Aragón, M. C., Bernalte, M. J., & Gata, J. L. (1998). Volatile compounds present in six types of dry-cured ham from south European countries. Food Chemistry, 61, 493–503.
- Shahidi, F., & Cadwallader, K. R. (1997). Flavor and lipid chemistry of seafoods: overview. In F. Shahidi & K. R. Cadeallader (Eds.). Flavor and lipid chemistry of seafoods. ACS symposium series 674 (pp. 1–8). Washington, DC: American Chemical Society.
- Sigma–Aldrich (2004). Flavors and fragrance. Milwaukee, WI: Sigma– Aldrich.
- Spurvey, S., Pan, B. S., & Shahidi, F. (1998). Flavour of shellfish. In F. Shahidi (Ed.), Flavor of meat, meat products and seafoods (pp. 159–196). London: Blackie Academic Professional.
- Subba Rao, G. N. (1967). Indo-pacific Fisheries Council Regional Studies. No. 4 fish processing in the Indo-pacific area. Thailand: FAO Regional Office for Asia and the Far East.
- Tehrani, K. A., Kersiene, M., Adams, A., Venskutonis, R., & De Kimpe, N. (2002). Thermal degradation studies of glucose/glycine melanoidins. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry, 50, 4062–4068.
- Triqui, R., & Guth, H. (1997). Determination of potent odorants in ripened anchovy (Engraulis encrasicholus L.) by aroma extraction dilution analysis and by gas chromatography-olfactometry of headspace samples. In F. Shahidi & K. R. Cadwallader (Eds.). *flavor and* lipid chemistry of seafoods. ACS symposium series 674 (pp. 31–38). Washington DC: American Chemical Society.
- van den Dool, H., & Kratz, P. D. (1963). A generalization of the retention index system including linear temperature programmed gas– liquid partition chromatography. Journal of Chromatography, 11, 463–471.
- Whitfield, F. B. (1999). Biological origins of off-flavours in fish and crustaceans. Water Science and Technology, 40, 265–272.
- Whitfield, F. B., Freeman, D. J., & Bannister, P. A. (1981). Dimethyl trisulphide: an important off-flavour component in the royal red prawn (Hymenopenaeus sibogae). Chemistry and Industry, 692–693.
- Whitfield, F. B., Freeman, D. J., Last, J. H., & Bannister, P. A. (1981). Bis(methylthio)methane, and important off-flavour component in prawns and sand lobsters. Chemistry and Industry, 158–159.
- Whitfield, F. B., & Tindale, C. R. (1984). The role of microbial metabolites in food off-flavour. Food Technology Australia, 36, 204–213.
- Yaylayan, V. A. (1997). Classification of the Maillard reaction: a conceptual approach. Trends in Food Science and Technology, 8, 13–18.